

Asianart.com offers pdf versions of some article for the convenience of our visitors and readers. These files should be printed for personal use only. Note that when you view the pdf on your computer in Adobe reader, the links to main image pages will be active: if clicked, the linked page will open in your browser. This article can be viewed online at: <http://asianart.com/articles/heller4>

Fourteen Thangkas of the 'Brug pa bKa' brgyud pa

an 18th century series of thangka linking Tibet and Bhutan in the Zimmerman Family Collection **

by Amy Heller

(click on the small image for full screen image with captions)

This article is a brief presentation of a complete series of thangkas which represent a lineage of lamas painted in the first half of the 18th century, probably in Central Tibet. Each painting has a central figure of a religious hierarch identified by his name on the reverse of the painting along with consecration inscriptions. The entire series was purchased by Jack and Muriel Zimmerman several decades ago. [1] Subsequently, the Zimmerman family retained several in their collection, several were donated to museums and others were acquired by private collectors. Over the years, individual paintings have been published in exhibition and museum catalogues, but the present study is the first publication of the complete series together. The Zimmermans requested that I study the inscriptions of their paintings in 2001, whereupon I started to attempt to trace the other paintings. The quest has been long. One painting remains to be located, thus the name inscription on the back has not been read. However, thanks to the Zimmerman's photographs of the front of each thangka in the entire series, it has been possible to research the series as a whole. David Jackson identified several paintings of the series in two articles but his research was compromised because he did not study the full series and all of the inscriptions, thus the order he proposed was inaccurate. He initially attributed the series as " a lineage of 'Brug pa bKa' brgyud pa, dates probably to the second half of the 16th century." (Jackson 2006:71; Jackson 2008: 213). [2] Indeed, as Jackson identified correctly, the masters portrayed are hierarchs of the 'Brug pa bka' brgyud pa in Tibet and there are also portraits of several Bhutanese hierarchs, as this was the paramount religious school of Bhutan. The key to accurate chronological attribution is the main donor figures who are represented on the first painting and the last painting, an aristocratic gentleman accompanied by two slender women whose short hair and distinctive woven garments are characteristic of the typical Bhutanese costume (see Figure 1, Donors on first painting and Figure 2, Donors on last painting). The man is to be identified as Miwang (mi dbang) Pho lha nas, the lay ruler of Tibet ca 1730-1747, [3] with his two wives who hailed from an illustrious Bhutanese family who settled near Gyantse after their ancestors were driven out of Bhutan in the aftermath of the Zhabdrung Ngawang Namgyal (Zhabs drung Ngag dbang rnam rgyal 1594-1651) 's creation of the Bhutanese state during the first half of the 17th century. [4] Miwang became involved in Bhutanese politics following the civil disorder in Bhutan due to civil war as of 1729, which led Tibet to successfully invade Bhutan in 1730. This led to a rapprochement of Tibet and Bhutan in a process of diplomatic reconciliation as the civil war was quelled and harmonious relations ensued (Ardussi 1997). Miwang had close relations with several Bhutanese religious hierarchs at this time, one of whom is represented with him in the final portrait of this series. [5] The identification of Miwang Pholha is further confirmed thanks to the portrait of him and his wives which are mural paintings in the La mo temple near Lhasa, consecrated during his reign (see Figure 3 the mural painting of the La mo temple, photograph by Françoise Pommaret, 2006). [6]



Fig. 1



Fig. 2



Fig. 3

The order of the lineage is as follows: the Buddha Vajradhara (1), the siddha Tilopa (2) who taught to Naropa (3), who taught to Marpa (4), who taught Milarepa (5), who taught Gampopa (6) who taught Phag mo grupa (7), who taught the siddha Gling ras pa (8), who taught Tsang pa gya re (9), the first Gyalwang (powerful lord, rgyal dbang) Rinpoche of the 'Brug pa school. The second Gyalwang Kunga Paljor(10) then taught the lama 'Brug chen Ngagwang Chogyal (11), who taught the Third Gyalwang Chos kyi grags pa (12). The 8th rJe mkhan po (Head Abbot) of Bhutan, Tenzin norbu is next in the lineage (13), followed by the final portrait of a 'Brug pa hierarch (14), whose identification remains to be determined (as its present location is unknown, the name inscription on the reverse has not yet been read).

This article will focus on the iconography of the paintings and the readings of the inscriptions which identify significant people and places in the lives of the lineage holders. It remains to be established whether the painters were Bhutanese or Tibetan, or an atelier composed of painters of both nationalities. According to John Ardussi, specialist on Bhutanese history, one of the outcomes from the

diplomatic reconciliation of the early 18th century was a joint Bhutan-Tibet exercise to reconstruct Ralung monastery with financial contributions and artisans sent from Bhutan, including artisans to work on the monastery's mural paintings (see Ardussi 1997). This was in 1747-49, although the project had been started in 1736, 11 years before Pholhanas' death. Pholhanas was a sponsor of this project. Thus, the diplomatic demarche of the 1732-37 period was a huge breakthrough. It unleashed many initiatives to patch up relations between Bhutan and Tibet; Thus the focus on Ralung as a symbolic initiative (personal communication 8.01.2011).



Fig. 4

The paintings are uniform in size and, relatively uniform in their composition, all bordered in red, with the main figure in the center, or slightly left or right of center, usually seated on a low throne, receiving offerings. The portrait is situated within an idealized landscape, replete with ponds, an abundance of water fowl and birds as well as animals (see Figure 4 and Figure 5); the hills and dales are dotted with buildings (temples and monasteries), with waterfalls, groves of pines, craggy rocks and caves for hermits to meditate. The painting shows great sense of minute attention to detail. There is a characteristically delicate treatment of the facial features of the subject of each thangka, while the attendants and secondary figures are far less delicately rendered, the exception being the portraits of Mi dbang Pho lha nas and his wives on the first and last paintings of the series. One may also call attention to the profusion of brocades which juxtapose weaves and patterns in brilliant colors. There is a constant effort in shading of the color fields to render volume within fine outlines, which is visible particularly in the faces. All the

thangka of this series have the principal subject whose head is portrayed within a circular halo, some of which are opaque tones of green and red, while some are translucent shades of pink, but all have a very fine outline. These spheres are perfectly formed, evanescent and rich with ephemeral color, heightening the subject portrayed. This specific halo, the distinctive wooden frame of certain thrones, and the numerous animals and creatures with their highly expressive faces characterize this series of thangka. In some respects, the paintings in this series may be qualified as an eclectic aesthetic, but in the light of the research of Penba Wangdu on the mKhyen brtse and the development of the mKhyen lugs school of painting, this series certainly reflects the later phase of the mKhyen lugs aesthetic grammar (see Penba Wangdu's article in this volume). According to Jackson (2008:208), "the main Bhutanese painting styles evidently were branches of the Tibetan painting school of sMan ris, although they were also influenced by later stylistic currents in eastern and central Tibet." His remarks are judicious. Relatively few ancient Bhutanese mural paintings have been published, a few notable exceptions were published by Michael Aris (1979), as well as *The Dragon's Gift: Sacred Arts of Bhutan* (Serindia Publications 2008) and the photographs of Françoise Pommaret, ethnologist and historian of Bhutan (www.himalayanart.com). As an example of the refined style of an ancient Bhutanese mural, we may recall the portrait of Phajo 'Brugom Shigpo, his wife and four sons in the rTa mgo monastery founded in 1689 (Figure 6, courtesy of Guy von Strydonck). The extreme delicacy of the facial features and certain throne models in the Zimmerman series recall these mural paintings of the monastery of rTa mgo (Aris 1979: 180, plate 16), (See Figure 7: mural of rTa mgo monastery, portrait of 'Brug pa Kun legs whose throne finials recall those of thangka XIII: the 8th rJe mkhan po bsTan 'dzin nor bu, photograph by Françoise Pommaret). Also certain landscape elements such as the stylized shaded craggy rocks of thangka V, Milarepa, are strikingly similar to the rock formations depicted in the mural painting of the rTa mgo temple, beside the portrait of the Zhabdrung's father 'Brug chen bsTan pa'i nyi ma (1567-1619) (Figure 8, photograph by Françoise Pommaret). [7] However, according to John Ardussi whose opinion is corroborated by Françoise Pommaret, certain architectural conventions in the manner of painting of the monasteries are unlikely to be painted by a Bhutanese as they do not follow Bhutanese conventions (personal communication). Thus the hypothesis of an atelier of Tibetan and Bhutanese painters is proposed, working together in Central Tibet, under the auspices of Mi dbang Pho lha nas, during this momentous period of Tibetan and Bhutanese relations in the first half of the 18th century.



Fig. 5



Fig. 6



Fig. 7



Rock Formations



1. Vajradhara

I. Vajradhara

Central painting, Zimmerman collection

Upper left Saraha mahasiddha

Upper right Buddha ? (inscribed: byang chub sems dpa' blo gros rin chen, as if a monk's name)

Center - Vajradhara

Left - Vajrasattva, white

Right - Vajrasattva blue

Lower left - group of monks, no names legible, two deer offering branches in homage

Lower center - aristocratic man with an attendant and 2 women: no inscription. Comparative research allows identification as the lay ruler of Tibet of mid -18th c, Mi dbang Pho lha nas bsod noms stobs rgyas, 1689-1747) and his 2 wives of Bhutanese origin

Lower right - Vaiśravaṇa

Reverse inscription rDo rje 'chang, Ka pa (translation: Vajradhara, number 1)

II. Tilopa

First painting right, Zimmerman collection

Inscribed on reverse in Tibetan print script: Te lo pa (Tilopa) In Tibetan cursive script : dbyes (> g.yas) dang po: first on the right In sanscrit : om a hum

Upper left 12 arm Samvara yab-yum

At center Tilopa underneath a magnificent parasol, surrounded by several mahasiddhas.

Upper right siddha holding intestines, no name (Luipa, usually holds intestines)

Middle right siddha yab yum on tiger, inscribed: Dombhi heruka

Dakini inscribed: Sum ha ku ra

Lower right siddha : no name



II. Tilopa

Right siddha: Klu grub , this is the mahasiddha Nagarjuna recognizable by the snake hood



III. Naropa

III. Naropa 956-1040

First painting on the left, Zimmerman collection

Inscribed on reverse - in Tibetan print letters: Na ro pa (Naropa)

In Tibetan cursive script: g.yon dang : first on the left

In Sanscrit: Om a hum

Upper left - no inscription Hevajra

Upper left - lama dPal Ye shes snying po

Left - mahasiddha Mi dri pa (Maitripa)

Left - mahasiddha inscribed: Spyi ther pa seated on tiger skin

Upper right - Mahasiddha Ku ri (Ku ku ripa with dogs and jug)

Right - Mahasiddha inscribed : rTi bu pa seated on white mammal skin with jug at his back

Right lower - mahasiddha inscribed: Penta pa rte two letters illegible seated on yellow leopard skin under tree

IV. Marpa 1012- 1096

Second painting on the right, Zimmerman Collection

Inscribed on reverse in Tibetan print letters Mar pa

In Tibetan cursive g.yas rnyis (>gnyis) pa: second on the right

Upper left blue Buddha Samantabhadra (inscribed: byang chub sems dpa' kun tu bzang po)

Center Upper register lama Khyung po rnal 'byor ,

Dakini Niguma (inscribed Ni gu ma, this is the name of Marpa's wife)

Monk with green halo inscribed Tshur ston (one of the student translators)

Lama in lay robes, at far right, inscribed rNgog ston (the famous translator rNog Lotsawa)

At center, Marpa with his wife Niguma

Beneath at left lama inscribed ngo tshur rton (same as Tshur ston above)

Beneath at right lama inscribed Mar pa 'go legs (a cousin of Marpa, also a translator)



IV. Marpa



V. Milarepa

V. Milarepa 1040-1123

Second painting on the left? Framed, Zimmerman collection

Inscriptions on reverse not read due to frame.

Upper left, 2 hermits and Vajra varahi

Inscriptions hermit top Dom pa, lower hermit Ni ba 'od

Vajravarahi inscribed Phag mo (abbreviation for : rdo rje phag mo)

Left border

Disciples Se ban Ras pa

Ma ngan rdzong ston pa

Ras chung pa (principle disciple of Milarepa)

Khyi ra ba 'khros pa the hunter renouncing at hunting the deer

Khyi ra ba gus pa – the hunter making reverence to the dog

VI. Gampopa 1079-1153

Third painting on right (presumed)

Inscribed on reverse in Tibetan print Sgam po pa

No indication of order or numbering on reverse

Upper left, two monks

Rje sgom rtsul at left, (Gampopa's nephew)

Second name with pandita hat: rjo 'o e abbreviated : Jo bo rje , Atisa

Upper right, two men

Lama in white robes inscription 'grom rton (sic: brom ston) (disciple of Atisa)

Dus gsum mkhyen pa, the first Black hat Karmapa lama

Gampopa at center

Monastery but no name inscribed, maybe the Dagla Gampo monastery founded by Gampopa (this is in Dvags po region of Tibet, near a mountain called Dagla gampo (dvags la sgam po) .

Monk beside small chorten. name Illegible

Lower register left

Black hat lama: rgyal mtshan (this is not enough to identify the lama)

Middle: lho la yag pa (also cannot be identified, but La Yag is a district in Bhutan)

Right : illegible

Lower register right: 3 small men walking - inscription: 'ams pa mi gsum > khams pa mi gsum, this means "the three men from Khams". This collective term refers to Gampopa's 3 principle disciples, Phag mo gru pa, the First Karmapa Dus gsum mkhyen pa, and gSal ston sho re ba.



VI. Gampopa



VII. Phag mo gru pa

VII. Phag mo gru pa (1110-1170)

Private Collection (formerly Ford Collection, photography courtesy of Arnold Lieberman Gallery)

Inscription on reverse in Tibetan print letters Phag mo gru pa

Inscription in Tibetan cursive script g.yon sum pa, third on the left.

Upper register, left to right:

Lama with vase, rTag lung thang pa , Taglung thangpa chen po

Mahasiddha, Bir ba pa, Virupa

Buddha at center, rton (>ston) pa rin po che

Lama with white robe, Sa chen , Sa chen kun dga' snying po

Lama with red robe, Par phu ba (unidentified)

Monasteries beside Phag mo gru pa have not been photographed for inscriptions

Lower register, left to right:

Rgyal ba thog sdug pa (unidentified): three lamas at center, inscriptions too effaced,

Lama at far right: pyan mnga' lha gzig ras pa (unidentified)

VIII. Gling ras pa Padma rdo rje (1128-1188)

Los Angeles County Museum of Art M.81.206.12

Inscription on reverse Ye dharma written in Sanscrit

Name and position inscription not apparent, painting is now framed.

Upper left monk: Bla ma Zhang (1123-1193), founder of Tshal Gungthang monastery and de facto ruler of Lhasa during 12th c.

Center top : inscription illegible, identified as Manjusri in Pal, P. Art of Tibet, LACMA.

Right: monk. Rgyal ba khyung tshang po, full name Khyung tshang pa Ye shes bla ma (1115-1176), a disciple of Ras chung pa (Milarepa's disciple).

Mid -left rgyal mar pa , Mar pa , one of the spiritual forefathers of the lineage

At right of Gling ras pa, an unidentified disciple (inscription partially effaced: Nyer nas ...'gro)

mid-right – inscription rJe sum pa, 12th c teacher of Gling ras pa and student of Ras chung pa, presenting white tormas offering to Gling ras pa

Lower left : inscription mnyams med zhig (epithet, literally meaning "the incomparable one",) this epithet is applied to many lamas...



VIII. Gling ras pa Padma rdo rje

thus this person cannot be categorically identified here.

Lower register center inscribed Gos lo tsa ba (1392-1481), the translator and Tibetan historian who compiled the book The Blue Annals.

Lower right: inscription rlung jo ye= rLung jo ye shes, a disciple of Gling ras pa's disciple Tsang pa gyare (gTsang pa rgya ras).



IX. Tsang pa gya re

IX. Tsang pa gya re (gTsang pa rgya ras: 1161-1211), Founder of the 'Brug pa school (Title: rGyal dbang 'Brug Rinpoche - the powerful dragon king, the precious lama)

Fourth painting on the left, Zimmerman Collection

Inscription on reverse in Tibetan script rGya ras, and in cursive g.yon zhi (>bzhi) pa, 4th on Left

Upper left 2 lamas

Rgya ...yang dgon/ unidentified, possibly a lama from the Yang dgon monastery founded by Lama Zhang (see Gling ras pa thangka).

rGod tshang pa mgon po rdo rje: 1189-1258, principal disciple of gTsang pa rgya ras

Upper right two lamas

Mkhas grub ...n pa (illegible)

rGyal 2 Lo ras pa (1187 -1250) other principal disciple of gTsang pa, went to Bhutan and established Bum thang thar pa ling monastery, founder of the teachings called "lower tradition" smad 'brug of the 'brug pa bka' brgyud pa school..

Monastery at Right: inscription Ra (>rwa) lung: This is the Ralung monastery which is the base monastery of the 'brug pa lineage in Tibet, founded by him

Monk beneath the monastery: Sangs rgyas dbon ras dar ma seng ge : Darma senge was the successor of Tsangpa gya re as abbot of Ralung (1177- 1237)

Center Tsang pa gya re

Left upper lama: rje 'jam dbyangs mgon po (Jam yang gon po) disciple of Lo ras pa, 1208- ca. 1260

Left lower lama: mgon po tsa ri ras chen : the hermit of Tsa ri, sacred pilgrimage mountain in southern Tibet

X. 'Brug pa Hierarch, Virginia Museum of Fine Arts , 91.489.

Framed painting, identification of lama cannot be determined nor certainty of position

Probable identification: Second rGyal dbang Rinpoche of 'Brug pa lineage, Kunga Paljor (Kun dga' dpal 'byor) (1428-1476)

? presumed to be 5th painting on left due to other inscriptions

Kun dga' dpal 'byor was born at Rwa lung and his primary monastery was Rwa lung. He was notably the teacher of 'Brug chen Ngawang Chogyal (thangka XI ngag dbang chos rgyal)

Upper register:

Upper left, Two monks.

First: rJe gzhon nu seng ge (1200-1266, went to Rwa lung monastery in 1237

Second is wearing a Pandita hat and is inscribed: Pandita Nags kiy rin chen. This is Vanaratna, 1384-1468, a Bengali pandita and poet who came to Tibet and to Bhutan where is he said to have founded a chapel in the Punakha monastery. Vanaratna is documented as a teacher of Kunga Paljor in the Brug pa historical sources.

Center – Mahasiddha with arrow, Sha ba ri dbang phyug (Sha ba ri pa)

Upper right, two monks. 1428-1476)

Name of first: Phrul (>khrul) zhig nam mkha' rnal 'byor , unidentified

At far right: byang sems seng ge. This is the fourth abbot in the succssion of Rwa lung (one of the teachers who preceded Kunga Paljor at Rwalung)

Two monasteries on left, no inscriptions

Two monasteries on right. Upper at right: Yang dgon Yang monastery

Lower at right: ' Brug, refers to the heart monastery of the 'Brug pa lineage at Ra lung

mid-left siddha gTsang snyon (smyon) pa (the Crazy hermit of Tsang)

mid-right siddha dBu snyon (smyon) pa (the Crazy hermit of dBus)

Lower left register: monk Dge slong rin chen rnam rgyal, this monk was a student of Kun dga' dpal 'byor

Center: Thang tong rgyal po right lama: no name

The presence of Thang tong rgyal po is crucial to this identification as he is considered to be a disciple of Kunga' Paljor.



X. 'Brug pa Hierarch



XI. Brug chen Ngawang Chogyal

XI. Brug chen Ngawang Chogyal (chos rgyal ngag dbang, 1465-1540 - full name. Brug chen Ngag dbang chos rgyal), 14th Abbot of Ralung monastery, teacher of Padma dkar po, illustrious historian of the Brug pa lineage.

Zimmerman collection

Fifth painting on right

Inscription on reverse: rJe Rin po che Ngag dbang Chos rgyal in print letters

In Tibetan cursive script: g.yas lnga pa (fifth on the right)

Ye dharma prayer

Ngawang Chogyal made several visits to Bhutan during which he founded a number of temples and meditation centres in western Bhutan, most of which still exist.[8]

Upper left: lama Rgyal sras (unidentified)

Center lama holding prayer beads, name effaced.

Right two lamas pas rgya pa seng ge rin chen , unidentified

Sa kya pa rin -cho grub dpal bzang po, unidentified

Right lama at right border : Stag lung chos rje (Taglung chos je), probably his student Taglung abbot Ngag dbag grags pa. (wearing yellow robes).

Next to Brug chen Ngag wang: a lama seated legs pendant, no name

At middle , lama with arm extended Lhan bde rab 'jam (not identified)

Under parasol, lama making offering: Ting Ting rdo rje 'dzin pa (not identified)

Monastery beneath is labeled Ting Ting gnyis pa (the second Ting Ting)

Protector red at far right: rje rmog The holy helmet.

XII. rGyal dbang Rinpoche III, Jamyang chos kyi grags pa (1478 -1523 'Jam dbyangs chos kyi grags pa)

Newark Museum accession number 2000.31

Inscription on reverse: Chos kyi grags pa in Tibetan print letter, g.yon drug pa in Tibetan cursive script, Ye dharma in Sanskrit

(sixth on the left, Chos kyi grags pa). Full name 'jam dbyangs chos kyi grags pa

Upper left lama, Gong ma bkra shis rnam rgyal, unidentified

Center lama inscription effaced

Far right lama: 'gro ba'i mgon po chos rgyal bzangs(?) , unidentified



XII. rGyal dbang Rinpoche III

It is important to note that Jamyang chos kyi grags pa was a student of Ngag wang chos rgyal.



XIII. Tenzin Norbu

XIII. Tenzin Norbu (bsTan 'dzin nor bu), 8th rJe Mkhan po lama of Bhutan (1689-1744)

Sixth on the right, Zimmerman collection

Inscription on reverse in Tibetan print letters bstan nor bu

Inscription in Tibetan script g.yas drug pa, 6th on the right

Upper left : Tshe dpag med Amitayus

Upper right Sgrol ma Tara

At far left , sprul sku shes rab seng ge

Lama 'Jam dbyangs ye shes rin chen

Grub chen blo gros chos rgyal

Monastery at right, center inscription : klu khang (naga temple) this does not appear to be the Klukang temple of Lhasa.

Monastery lower left corner : Pho brang Yar rtse

At the feet of the lama, several people are presenting offerings and rhinoceros horns. These people have no inscribed names (or they are effaced).

XIV. The Missing Lama

Identification unknown at present

???

Present to Charmion von Wegan from J.+ M. Zimmerman, presumed to be donated to Tibet Centre, New York, to Khyongla Rinpoche.

Presumed to be last painting due to the donors which appear here and on the Vajradhara

Upper left: no slide

Center upper register, left to right

Mkhan chen rje rin

'Jam dbyangs chos kyi grags pa (see Newark Museum thangka)

.... blo gros (inscription partially effaced)

at left, next to throne : ? Kun dga' rin po che at right: upper lama inscription effaced

lower lama : Ha ... khung (?)

Donors : no inscription.

In comparison with the mural paintings in La mo temple, near Lhasa of Pho lha nas and his two wives, (see Figure 3), these portraits are identified, and the sponsorship of Pho lha nas for the series is understood.

At right border : goddess inscribed: rdo rje g.yu sgron ma



XIV. The Missing Lama

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Sources in Western Languages

Aris, M. 1979. *Bhutan The Early History of a Himalayan Kingdom*, Warminster: Aris and Philips Ltd.

Ardussi, J. 1997. The Rapprochement between Bhutan and Tibet under the Enlightened Rule of sDe-srid XIII Shes-rab-dbang-phyug (r. 1744-1763). In H. Krasser et al (eds), *Tibetan Studies – Proceedings of the 7th Seminar of the International Association for Tibetan Studies*, Graz 1995. Vienna, Austrian Academy of Sciences, vol. 1, 17-27 (Reprinted in *Journal of Bhutan Studies*, vol. 1, no. 1)

Ardussi, J. 2004. Formation of the state of Bhutan ('Brug gzhung) in the 17th century and its Tibetan antecedents. In C. Cüppers (ed), *The Relationship between Religion and State (chos srid zung 'brel) in Traditional Tibet*. Lumbini: Lumbini International Research Institute.

Dargye, Y. and Sorenson, P. with Gyönpo Tshering. 2008. *Play of the Omniscient, Life and works of Jamgön Ngawang Gyatshen, an Eminent 17th-18th Century Drukpa Master*, Thimphu: National Library and Archives.

Kapstein, M. T. 2006. *The Tibetans*, Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Kapstein, M. T. 2009/2012. *The Oracle and Temple of La mo Icoq: Aspects of History and Iconography* (conference presented at the International Seminar on Tibetan Art and Archaeology Beijing October 2009 and at the Courtauld Institute of Art, London April 2012).

Jackson, D. 2006. The Place of Provenance in the study of styles: suggestions for improving attributions of origin in Tibetan art history. In S. Onoda (ed), *The Styles of Buddhist Art in Asia_ Tibet, Mongolia and Bhutan*, Kyoto: Research and Information Center for Asian Religious Culture of Bukkyo University.

Jackson, D. 2008. 'Brug pa bKa' bryud and Bhutanese Painting. In J. Ardussi and S. Tobgyay (eds), *Written Treasures of Bhutan*. Thimphu: National Library of Bhutan, 205-231.

Lauf, D. 1976. *Secret Revelation of Tibetan Thangkas*, Freiburg im Breisgau: Aurum Verlag.

Pal, P. 1983. *Art of Tibet*, Los Angeles: Los Angeles County Museum of Art.

Petech, L. 1973. *Aristocracy and Government in Tibet 1728-1959*. Roma: Istituto Italiano per il Medio ed Estremo Oriente.

Pommaret, F. *Bhutan Himalayan Mountain Kingdom: Odyssey Illustrated Guides* (translation of *Le Bhoutan Au plus secret de l'Himalaya*, Paris: Gallimard 2005.)

Rhie, M. and Thurman, R. 1991. *Wisdom and Compassion The Sacred Art of Tibet*, New York: Harry N. Abrams, Publishers.

Sources in Tibetan Language

mDo mkhar tshe ring dbang rgyal (1733) *Mi dbang rtogs brjod*, accessed at www.TBRC.org (/W1KG1253-I1KG1276)

bsTan 'dzin dpal 'byor 1995. *Rdo ring pandita rnam thar*, Beijing: Zhong guo Zang xue chu ban she (translated by Zhang Huasha, Columbia University: <http://tibetan-biographies.wikischolars.columbia.edu/Rdo-rin-Bandi-tai+rnam+thar>)

Endnotes:

1. It is unusual to have a series of 14 thangka, as usually the arrangement would be the Buddha at center, surrounded by 7 masters on both sides, thus 15 thangka. However, it appears that the full count of this series is 14 pieces, as the first thangka and last thangka both represent the donor figures. As some of the paintings are framed, it has not been possible to read all the of the inscriptions on the reverse. To the knowledge of Jack and Muriel Zimmerman, the series was complete with 14 paintings.
 2. Previous scholars attributed the series to Central Tibet, 18th century, Stag lung monastery. See Lauf 1976:116-117, "An Abbot of Stag-lung", 18th century; Pal (1983: 94) and Rhie (1991:246-247) concurred with this attribution for other thangkas of the same series.
 3. Petech 1973:211-216,, citing the *Mi dbang rtogs brjod (71 b-76b)*, accessed thanks to Tibetan Buddhist Resource Centre, www.tbrc.org.
 4. See Ardussi (2004: 42, and note 34) for discussion of the Zhab drung's "intolerance of Bhutanese who would not submit to his government; many opponents were expelled from the county, among which the ancestors of the sKyid-sbug, the family of Pho-lha-nas' wife."
- On the foundation of the Bhutanese state see Michael Aris, *Bhutan* (1979), and Françoise Pommaret, *Bhutan Himalayan Mountain Kingdom* (2009).
5. bsTan 'dzin dpal 'byor 1995 discussses Pho lha nas' daughter as Zhabs drung bde ldan sgrol ma, born in 1731. The use of the title zhabs drung is indicative of the importance of the Bhutanese ancestry of the family of Pho lha nas' wife.
 6. I am grateful to Françoise Pommaret for kindly providing this photograph. See Kapstein 2006: 152, figure 20, for a black and white photograph of this same mural painting. Kapstein identified the seated hierarch as Miwang or perhaps his son, however in the light of the research presented here, the identification as Miwang is certain. Kapstein's photo was made in 2004, when the mural had slightly less water damage than in 2006 when Pommaret made her photograph.
 7. See also the rock formations in the slightly later mural painting portraying Milarepa in the Ri mo can temple, of the Bum thang valley illustrated in Aris 1979: 166 Plate 12.
 8. Dargye and Sorenson 2008:30 note 40, citing the *bKa' brgyud gser 'phreng rgyas pa* (vol. 2, 1982:542-577).
-